SPECIALISTS AND SERVICES FOR THIS AUCTION

Sven Becker  
Head of Department, Books, Manuscripts  
+1 212 636 2661  
sbecker@christies.com

Christina Geiger  
Senior Specialist, Books  
+1 212 636 2667  
cgeiger@christies.com

Peter Klarnet  
Senior Specialist, Americana, Manuscripts  
+1 212 636 2668  
pklarnet@christies.com

Heather Weintraub  
Associate Specialist, Books & Manuscripts  
+1 212 636 2673  
hweintraub@christies.com

Thomas Venning  
Head of Department, Books & Manuscripts, London  
+44 207 389 2255  
tvenning@christies.com

Sophie Hopkins  
Specialist, Books & Manuscripts  
+44 207 752 3144  
shopkins@christies.com

HEAD OF SALE  
Peter Klarnet  
pklarnet@christies.com  
Tel: +1 212 636 2668

SALE COORDINATOR  
Elise Rise  
erise@christies.com  
Tel: +1 212 636 2665  
Fax: +1 212 636 4928

HEAD OF SALE MANAGEMENT  
Lauren Carlucci  
lcarlucci@christies.com  
Tel: +1 212 641 7535

ABSENTEE AND TELEPHONE BIDS  
Tel: +1 212 636 2437  
Fax: +1 212 636 4938

AUCTION RESULTS  
christies.com

CATALOGUES ON LINE  
Lottfinder®  
www.christies.com

INSURANCE  
Tel: +1 212 484 4879  
Fax: +1 212 636 4957

POST-SALE SERVICES  
Payment, Shipping and Collection  
Tel: +1 212 636 2650  
Fax: +1 212 636 4939  
Email: PostSaleUS@christies.com

INTERNATIONAL PRINTED BOOKS AND MANUSCRIPTS & SCIENTIFIC INSTRUMENTS DEPARTMENTS

INTERNATIONAL HEAD OF GROUP  
Margaret Ford  
Tel: +44 (0)20 7389 2150

GLOBAL MANAGING DIRECTOR  
Karl Hermanns  
Tel: +44 (0)20 7389 2425

INTERNATIONAL CONSULTANT  
Felix de Marez Oyens  
Tel: +33 1 40 76 85 58

BOOKS AND MANUSCRIPTS  
LONDON  
Margaret Ford  
Thomas Venning  
Kay Sutton  
Julian Wilson  
Eugenio Donadoni  
Sophie Hopkins  
Mark Wiltshire  
France Huyard  
Consultants  
Rupert Neelands (Printed Books)  
Jane Flower (Archives)  
Catherine Reynolds (Illuminated Manuscripts)  
Moshe Brown (Hebraica)

NEW YORK  
Sven Becker  
Christina Geiger  
Peter Klarnet  
Heather Weintraub  
Rhiannon Knol  
Consultant  
Chris Coover (Manuscripts)

PARIS  
Adrien Legendre  
Philippine de Sailly  
Vincent Belloy

SCIENTIFIC INSTRUMENTS  
James Hyslop

Email. First initial followed by last name@christies.com  
(eg. Sven Becker = sbecker@christies.com)

AUCTION CALENDAR

31 OCTOBER – 8 NOVEMBER 2018  
ON THE SHOULDERS OF GIANTS ONLINE

1-8 NOVEMBER 2018  
SCULPTED BY NATURE ONLINE

20 NOVEMBER 2018  
LIVRES RARES ET MANUSCRITS PARIS

28 NOVEMBER 2018  
RUSSIAN LITERARY FIRST EDITIONS AND MANUSCRIPTS – HIGHLIGHTS FROM THE EDEN MARTIN COLLECTION LONDON

4 DECEMBER 2018  
FINE PRINTED BOOKS & MANUSCRIPTS INCLUDING AMERICANA NEW YORK

12 DECEMBER 2018  
VALUABLE BOOKS AND MANUSCRIPTS LONDON

03/10/2018
ALBERT EINSTEIN
THE GOD LETTER
TUESDAY 4 DECEMBER 2018

PHOTO CREDITS
Cover and p.16: © bpk Bildagentur/Muenchner Stadtmuseum/Hermann Landshoff/Art Resource, NY

Inside front cover: Lotte Jacobi, Albert Einstein in the leather jacket © 1938 The University of New Hampshire. Portrait of Albert Einstein courtesy of the University of New Hampshire

Back cover: Mathematicians Albert Einstein and Kurt Godel taking a walk, January 1, 1954 © Leonard McCombe/The LIFE Picture Collection/Getty Images

Personality rights of ALBERT EINSTEIN are used with permission of The Hebrew University of Jerusalem. Represented exclusively by Greenlight.

AUCTION
Tuesday 4 December 2018
at 2.00 pm (Lot 1)
20 Rockefeller Plaza
New York, NY 10020

VIEWING
Friday 30 November 10.00 am - 5.00 pm
Saturday 1 December 10.00 am - 6.00 pm
Sunday 2 December 10.00 am - 6.00 pm
Monday 3 December 10.00 am - 6.00 pm
Tuesday 4 December 10.00 am - 2.00 pm

AUCTIONEER
John Hays (#0822982)

BIDDING ON BEHALF OF THE SELLER
The auctioneer may, at his or her sole option, bid on behalf of the seller up to but not including the amount of the reserve either by making consecutive bids or by making bids in response to other bidders. The auctioneer will not identify these as bids made on behalf of the seller and will not make any such bids at or above the reserve.

AUCTION LICENSE
Christie’s (#1213717)

AUCTION CODE AND NUMBER
In sending absentee bids or making enquiries, this sale should be referred to as BARUCH-16393

CONDITIONS OF SALE
This auction is subject to the Important Notices and Conditions of Sale set forth in this catalogue. [40]
People of various religious beliefs – or non-beliefs – have occasionally quoted Albert Einstein in support of their own outlooks.

One evening in Berlin, Einstein and his wife were at a dinner party when a guest expressed a belief in astrology. Einstein ridiculed the notion as pure superstition. Another guest stepped in and similarly disparaged religion. Belief in God, he insisted, was likewise a superstition.

At this point the host tried to silence him by invoking the fact that even Einstein harbored religious beliefs.

“It isn’t possible!” the skeptical guest said, turning to Einstein to ask if he was, in fact, religious.

“Yes, you can call it that,” Einstein replied. “Try and penetrate with our limited means the secrets of nature and you will find that, behind all the discernible laws and connections, there remains something subtle, intangible and inexplicable. Veneration for this force beyond anything that we can comprehend is my religion. To that extent I am, in fact, religious.”

Other believers like to cite an interview he gave shortly after his fiftieth birthday. “I’m not an atheist,” Einstein said when asked if he believed in God. “The problem involved is too vast for our limited minds. We are in the position of a little child entering a huge library filled with books in many languages. The child knows someone must have written those books. It does not know how. It does not understand the languages in which they are written. The child dimly suspects a mysterious order in the arrangement of the books but doesn’t know what it is. That, it seems to me, is the attitude of even the most intelligent human being toward God.”

His most beautiful statement of that sentiment was expressed to a sixth-grade girl who wrote asking of his religious beliefs. “Every one who is seriously involved in the pursuit of science becomes convinced that a
spirit is manifest in the laws of the Universe – a spirit vastly superior to that of man, and one in the face of which we with our modest powers must feel humble.” He replied. “In this way the pursuit of science leads to a religious feeling of a special sort, which is indeed quite different from the religiosity of someone more naïve.”

Throughout his life, he was consistent in deflecting the charge that he was an atheist. “There are people who say there is no God,” he told a friend, “But what makes me really angry is that they quote me for support of such views.” As he explained on another occasion, “What separates me from most so-called atheists is a feeling of utter humility toward the unattainable secrets of the harmony of the cosmos.”

However, he always was clear that he did not believe in a personal, interventionist God, one who will break the laws of the universe to make a miracle if you pray hard enough to him or her. “The main source of the present-day conflicts between the spheres of religion and of science lies in this concept of a personal God,” he argued. Scientists aim to uncover the immutable laws that govern reality, and in doing so they must reject the notion that divine will, or for that matter human will, plays a role that would violate this cosmic causality.

There were times, however, when Einstein was more outspokenly hostile toward religious beliefs, such as in the letter that is the subject of this catalogue. As this letter shows, his opinions about religion and his mode of expressing them varied over the years and days and sometimes depended on whom he was addressing.

Why was that? The explanation I think is the simplest one: because he was human. His feelings about religion varied at times. I know mine do. Do yours? If your answer is yes, you can understand why even Einstein probably felt different sentiments about religion at different times.

In this context, the letter being offered for sale provides a valuable piece for understanding the complex and beautiful mosaic of Einstein’s religious sentiments and beliefs.

In German. Two pages, 215 x 280mm, bearing several autograph emendations; with original transmittal envelope.

THE GOD LETTER

"The word God is for me nothing but the expression and product of human weakness, the Bible a collection of venerable but still primitive legends."

Einstein’s single most famous letter on God, his Jewish identity, and man’s eternal search for meaning. This remarkably candid, private letter was written a year before Einstein’s death and remains the most fully articulated expression of his religious and philosophical views: “The word God is for me nothing but the expression and product of human weaknesses, the Bible a collection of venerable but still rather primitive legends. No interpretation, no matter how subtle, can (for me) change anything about this.” Rather, Einstein invokes “our wonderful” Baruch Spinoza, the 17th-century Jewish Dutch philosopher with whom he strongly identified from an early age. Spinoza believed not in an anthropomorphic God who intervened in daily lives, but in a God beyond description, one responsible for the sublime beauty and orderliness of the universe.

And despite Einstein’s open identification with Judaism, he felt no differently toward it: “For me the unadulterated Jewish religion is, like all other religions, an incarnation of primitive superstition. And the Jewish people to whom I gladly belong, and in whose mentality I feel profoundly anchored, still for me does not have any different kind of dignity from all other peoples. As far as my experience goes, they are in fact no better than other human groups, even if they are protected from the worst excesses by a lack of power. Otherwise I cannot perceive anything ‘chosen’ about them.”

Einstein wrote in response to Eric Gutkind’s 1952 book, Choose Life: The Biblical Call to Revolt, which he read at the behest of Dutch mathematician and philosopher L.E.J. Brouwer (1881-1966). Though Einstein was unequivocal in his critique of Gutkind’s work (“it pains me that you claim a privileged position and try to defend it by two walls of pride, an external one as a human being and an internal one as a Jew”), he sought to establish a common ground between them, noting that they still agreed on “the essentials.” Prefacing his frank remarks on God and religion, he observed diplomatically that he and Gutkind both believed in the importance of a strong moral foundation that rose above self-interest and instead sought to benefit humanity (“striving for the improvement and refinement of existence”), while rejecting materialism as an end – a typically “un-American attitude” they shared. Provenance: Eric Gutkind (1877-1965) – Bloomsbury, 15 May 2008, Lot 303.


$1,000,000-1,500,000
Leben Herr Gutkind!

Anregung durch wiederholte Aufmerksamkeit Brovens habe ich in den letzten Tagen sehr gesehen in Ihrem Buch, für dessen Verarbeitung dan Ihm sehr dankbar. Was mir dabei besonders aufgefall war das, war sind einander inbegriffen auf die faktische Einstellung zum Leben und zur menschlichen Gesellschaft möglicher Umstände; Ihre persönliche These mit dem Stellen nach Rücksicht von zentrierten Menschen, stehen nach Verarbeitung und Reduktion des Disseins mit Bestimmung des neuen Menschenbubes, worin das bäuerliche Ding nur als Mittel angesehen ist, dem keine schneidende Funktion zugeordnet werden darf. (Diese Einstellung ist es besonders, die uns als eine Entwicklung, auch „männliche Achtung“ verbindet.)


Überhaupt empfinde ich es seltsamerweise, dass Sie eine privilegierte Stellung beanspruchen und Sie durch zwingende Macht, wie im Falle der Staat, zu verleihen suchte, eine andere als Menschen und eine innere als Ende. Als Menschen beanspruchen Sie gewissermaßen eine Dispensation der sonst unveränderten Kausalität, als Ende ein Treadily für Monothedismus. Also ist eine begrenzte Kausalität nicht überhaupt keine Kausalität mehr, was wohl zweistufig menschlicher Spiegel mit alle Schärfe erkannt hat. Und die monothedische...
Auffassung des Naturalismus wird im Prinzip durch Monopolisierung nicht aufgehen, Direktes solche Mauern können nicht nur zu einer gewissen SelbstVernichtung gelangen, über unsere moralischen Bestrebungen werden durch sie nicht gefördert, dagegen ist das Gegenteil.


Mit freundlicher Danks und besten Wünschen

 Ihr K. M. Einstein.
Princeton, 3.I.54

Lieber Herr Gutkind!


Mit freundlichen Dank und besten Wünschen,

Ihr A. Einstein.

Princeton, 3.I.54

Dear Mr Gutkind,

Inspired by Brouwer’s repeated suggestion, I have read a great deal in your book in the last few days: thank you very much for sending it to me. What struck me particularly was this. We are largely alike as regards our factual attitude to life and to the human community: an ideal that goes beyond self-interest, with the striving for release from ego-oriented desires, the striving for the improvement and refinement of existence, with an emphasis on the purely human element, by which inanimate things are to be perceived purely as a means, to which no dominant function is to be attributed. (It is especially this attitude that unites us as an authentically “un-American attitude”\textsuperscript{1}).

Nevertheless, without Brouwer’s encouragement I would never have brought myself to engage at all closely with your book because it is written in a language which is inaccessible to me. The word God is for me nothing but the expression and product of human weaknesses, the Bible a collection of venerable but still rather primitive legends. No interpretation, no matter how subtle, can (for me) change anything about this. These refined interpretations are naturally very diverse, and have virtually nothing to do with the original text. For me the unadulterated Jewish religion is, like all other religions, an incarnation of primitive superstition. And the Jewish people to whom I gladly belong, and in whose mentality I feel profoundly anchored, still for me does not have any different kind of dignity from all other peoples. As far as my experience goes, they are in fact no better than other human groups, even if they are protected from the worst excesses by a lack of power. Otherwise I cannot perceive anything “chosen” about them.

In general, it pains me that you claim a privileged position and try to defend it by two walls of pride, an external one as a human being and an internal one as a Jew. As a human being you claim to a certain extent a dispensation from the causality which you otherwise accept, as a Jew a privileged status for monotheism. But a limited causality is no longer a causality at all, as indeed our wonderful Spinoza originally recognised with absolute clarity. And the animistic conception of natural religions is in principle not cancelled out by monopolization. With such walls we can only attain a certain self-deception; but our moral efforts are not furthered by them. Quite the opposite.

Now that I have expressed our differences in intellectual convictions completely openly, it is still clear to me that we are very close to each other in the essentials, that is, in our evaluations of human behavior. What divides us is only intellectual padding or the “rationalization” in Freudian language. So I think that we would understand each other very well if we conversed about concrete things.

With friendly thanks and best wishes,

Yours,

A. Einstein

\textsuperscript{1} In English in the original.
ERIC GUTKIND (1877-1965)

Philosopher, teacher, and writer Eric Gutkind was born in Berlin and educated at the University of Berlin, where his broad-ranging studies included philosophy, philosophy of religion, psychology, anthropology, physics, mathematics, and sociology. During the course of his career, he became increasingly focused on Jewish philosophy. Choose Life, Gutkind’s third book, presented the Bible as a call to arms, and Judaism and Israel as incorruptible: “Israel is not merely the late result of a long evolution. It is an intrinsic part of reality, from the very beginning. Because it is a maximal possibility of evolution, it is the very principle of evolution” (226). While certain aspects of his philosophy intersected with Einstein’s moral outlook, it inherently relied on Biblical teaching, and in Einstein’s view, favored the Jewish religion above others – a stance antithetical to his core beliefs. Gutkind was also the author of The Absolute Collective: A Philosophical Attempt to Overcome our Broken State (1937) and The Body of God: First Steps Toward an Anti-Theology (1969).
The three members of the Olympia Academy, Conrad Habicht, Maurice Solovine, Albert Einstein. Emil Vollenweider und Sohn, Bern, c.1903.

Courtesy: ETH-Bibliothek Zürich, Bildarchiv
EINSTEIN’S RELIGION

At the age of 67, Albert Einstein sat down to reflect on his early life, penning a short work titled *Autobiographical Notes*. It was the closest he would ever come to a proper autobiography, and he described the process as writing “something like my own obituary.” It begins in Munich in 1875, where he was born to an “entirely irreligious (Jewish)” family – save for one uncle who attended synagogue as a way of hedging his bets (“Ah, but you never know,” this uncle would say) (AN 3; Clark 6). Einstein’s parenthetical description of his family’s Judaism seems to sum up the situation well; when the time came for his parents to enroll their young son in school, they defaulted to the most convenient option, a large Catholic school in their neighborhood called the Petersschule. Einstein excelled there by all accounts, even helping classmates along with their work, before leaving at age nine for the Luitpold Gymnasium, a progressive school that included religious instruction for its Jewish students. Though his family had little tolerance for the “ancient superstition” of scripture, it was at this point that young Einstein began to develop his own relationship with religion – biographer Walter Isaacson writes that “Despite his parents’ secularism, or perhaps because of it, Einstein rather suddenly developed a passionate zeal for Judaism,” with his sister later recalling: “He was so fervent in his feelings that, on his own, he observed Jewish religious strictures in every detail.” Indeed, during this time, he managed to keep kosher and observe the Sabbath – things that were “rather difficult to do when the rest of his family had a lack of interest bordering on disdain for such displays. He even composed his own hymns for the glorification of God, which he sang to himself as he walked home from school” (Jammer 15, Isaacson 16).

It was a short albeit memorable phase that reached its conclusion with Einstein’s exposure to science at around the age of 10, via a family friend named Max Talmud (later changed to Talmey). Talmud, a medical student, introduced him to Aaron Bernstein’s *People’s Books on Natural Science*, a work that Einstein would later recall reading “with breathless attention.” “Through the reading of popular scientific books, I soon reached the conviction that much in the stories of the Bible could not be true. The consequence was a positively fanatic orgy of freethinking coupled with the impression that youth is intentionally being deceived by the state through lies; it was a crushing impression. Suspicion against every kind of authority grew out of this experience, an attitude that has never left me” (AN 5, 15).

“I am a deeply religious nonbeliever.”
— Einstein on his 75th birthday, 1954
Stadt Zürich.
(Grosser Stadtrat)

Fragebogen
für
Bürgerrechtspeten.

1) Familien- und Vorname?
   Albert Einstein

2) jetziger Wohnort?
   Zürich, Goldstrasse 19

3) frühere Wohnorte in der Schweiz und Aufenthaltsdauer daselbst (von wann bis wann)?
   Oktober 1895 - Oktober 1896

4) Konfession?
   Konfession

5) Erlernter Beruf?
   Hl. Episkopat in Wilhemstal, Hypothek.

6) jetziger Beruf?
   Zug und Postfeindsin in Wilhemstal, im eigenen Besitz, ohne Gehalt.

7) Arbeiten Sie selbständig oder als Angestellter?

8) Bei wem arbeiteten Sie, seit Sie in der Schweiz sind? (je von wann bis wann?)
   Oktober 1895 - Oktober 1896

9) Sind Sie versichert?
   Nein
   a. Auf den Todesfall?
   b. Gegen Unfall?
   c. Gegen Krankheit?
   (bei wem, wie hoch und seit wann?)
Einstein thus reverted to family tradition, avoiding religion and authority from that point forward. The family business collapsed in 1894, and with it, his parents moved to Italy, leaving Einstein behind in Munich with distant relatives to continue his studies. Unhappy, he soon departed the Luitpold Gymnasium to study briefly in Aarau, Switzerland, before eventually enrolling in Zurich Polytechnic. Likely due to impending military service that would come with turning 17, he was decidedly against returning to Germany and chose instead to renounce his citizenship entirely. On his application for Swiss citizenship he would notably list his religious affiliation as “konfessionslos,” or non-denominational (CP 82).

Einstein’s feelings toward religion would be shaped further and even more definitively during his time in Zurich by wide reading, particularly works by Baruch Spinoza. In 1902, he met Maurice Solovine, a Romanian philosophy student at the University of Bern, and Conrad Habicht, a former mathematics student at Zurich Polytechnic. The three joined together to read the great thinkers and writers and debate their ideas, dubbing themselves “The Olympia Academy.” They made their way through literature including Sophocles’ Antigone and Cervantes’ Don Quixote, alongside David Hume’s A Treatise of Human Nature and Ernst Mach’s Analysis of the Sensations. It was the Jewish philosopher Baruch Spinoza, however, who would have the most enduring influence on Einstein. Spinoza’s God was an amorphous, impersonal God responsible for the orderliness of the universe and the awe-inspiring beauty of nature, and this philosophy, including a strong sense of determinism, resonated deeply with the scientist.

Over the decades that followed, Einstein would mostly have little to say on religion. Following his Nobel Prize in 1922 and his fiftieth birthday in 1929, however, he became more discursive, speaking more openly on his beliefs in interviews and essays – though never as definitively as he does in his letter to Gutkind, which remains the most succinct and powerful articulation of his views.
Einstein turned 75 in March 1954, two months after writing to Gutkind. The letter was written on January third, mere days into the year that would swiftly bring one of life’s universal milestones, and the reader cannot help but feel its gravitas, the “absolute clarity” that he credits to the “wonderful” Spinoza also present in his own words. More direct than his prior essays, interviews, and letters, it is unvarnished and unwavering; the words of a great genius who was perhaps feeling the end fast approaching. It addresses the philosophical and religious questions that mankind has wrestled with since the dawn of time – is there a God? do I have free will? – and in it we have one of the most respected minds of the twentieth century give us the fruit of his own lifelong contemplation.
He had arrived in Princeton, New Jersey, in 1933 as a refugee with his second wife, Elsa (who would pass away only a few years later in 1936), and his twenty odd years in America were anything but uneventful. Einstein embraced his new country, and his concerns that Hitler’s scientists were working on nuclear weaponry prompted him to leverage his celebrity to alert Franklin Roosevelt of the threat, and his 1939 letter to F.D.R. would set in motion government research that resulted in The Manhattan Project (a version of this letter – Einstein had written a long and short version – sold at Christie’s for $2,096,000 on 27 March 2002, lot 161). He admired his adopted home’s tolerance and respect for free thought, free speech, and non-conformist religious beliefs, and became an American citizen in 1940.

It was as a result of sentiments instilled so deeply in Einstein as a young man – a distrust of authority, the respect for individuality, democratic principles, and the desire for social equality – that he remained intent on trying to live the moral life he describes here in his letter to Gutkind, one striving toward the greater good and transcending selfish desires in pursuit of human progress. He believed in a cosmic religion that orchestrated the orderliness and sublime beauty of a great universe, and favored determinism over free will. His religion was without an anthropomorphic God who protects, decides, rewards, and punishes; in Einstein’s view, there was a God, but he was never listening.

To Gutkind he writes, too, of the Jewish people “to whom I gladly belong, and in whose mentality I feel profoundly anchored.” Though his early identification with Judaism was fleeting, the rise of Anti-Semitism in Germany at the close of the First World War brought him closer to the Jewish community and the growing Zionist movement – an affiliation which prompted Israel to offer Einstein the Presidency of the Jewish State upon the death of Chaim Weizmann in 1952 (he declined). In 1934, in a short piece titled “Jewish Ideals,” he had written: “The pursuit of knowledge for its own sake, an almost fanatical love of justice, and the desire for personal independence – these are the features of the Jewish tradition which make me thank my stars that I belong to it” (World 123). He felt the Jewish people were “devoted servants of truth, justice, and liberty,” but nonetheless his ideals held firm – he believed they were not superior, and that aspects of the Jewish faith were like any other and that the Bible was ultimately a story.

During the final years of his life, Einstein’s companion was a Czech woman named Johanna Fantova, a curator at Princeton’s Firestone Library whom he first met in Germany decades earlier. Fantova’s diary from her time with Einstein reflects two sides of the aging genius: one preoccupied with his deteriorating health who at times likened his increasingly frail body to that of an old car, and the other still very much one of the great minds of the century, reflecting on his place in the larger scientific landscape, and still in pursuit of a unified field theory.

In 1953, his old friends Maurice Solovine and Conrad Habicht wrote from Paris and Einstein’s reply was an homage to “An die unsterbliche Akademie Olympia” – “the immortal Olympia Academy” – that had helped him discover Spinoza so many years before: “All three of us academicians have at least shown ourselves to be durable. Even if we are also getting a bit decrepit, something of your bright and invigorating light still shines on our lonely existences.”
BENEDICTUS DE SPINOZA.

Cui natura, Deus, rerum cui cognitus ordo.
Hoc Spinosa statu conspiciendus erat.
Expressere viri faciem, sed pingere mentem
Zeuxidis artifices non valuerē manus.
ILLA viget scriptis: illic sublimia tractat:
Hunc quicumque cupis noscere, scripta lege.
NO GOD BUT SPINOZA’S GOD

REBECCA NEWBERGER GOLDBEIN

When Einstein’s general theory of relativity was published in 1915 it was generally acknowledged as an extraordinary intellectual achievement. Its internal coherence and conceptual audacity – Newtonian gravitation wasn’t conceived as a force between two large bodies but rather as a warping of the geometry of space-time – together with its dazzlingly beautiful mathematics made it a work of science that was akin to a work of art.

Other distinctive features of general relativity also drew it closer to the sphere of art. Unlike most scientific theories, which are collaborative, Einstein’s theory is the product of only one superbly creative mind. Perhaps its sole authorship helps explain its unusual unity. Like a work of art, it is all of a piece, so that if any aspect of it is confirmed, the whole theory is established.

However, Einstein’s general relativity initially rested on scant empirical evidence. As magnificent as its reimagining of the fundamental structure of the cosmos was, it couldn’t be regarded as scientifically corroborated.

But then, in 1919, a total solar eclipse created the conditions for testing the theory’s prediction that a massive body like the sun, in warping the geometry of space-time, would deflect the path of traveling light. (The eclipse made it possible to see stars that are usually invisible to us.) The British physicist Arthur Eddington, already a great admirer of general relativity, led a group of physicists to west Africa, where careful photos were taken as the eclipse was in progress. The photographic evidence revealed that the sun’s mass had deflected the light by 1.7 arc-seconds, which was exactly the measure predicted by general relativity. The findings made headlines all over the world, including my favorite, from The New York Times: LIGHTS ALL ASKEW IN THE HEAVENS; Men of Science More or Less Agog Over Results of Eclipse Observations. EINSTEIN THEORY TRIUMPHS; Stars Not Where They Seemed or Were Calculated To Be, but Nobody Need Worry.

Now the very features of the theory that had made it akin to art transformed it into a sui generis scientific achievement, making Einstein’s name the very eponym for genius – as in the expression “he’s no Einstein.” In fact, Einstein himself was heard to joke that he himself was “no Einstein.”

The physicist was forty years old when the solar eclipse shot him into stellar fame. When he was asked how he would have responded had the long-awaited observations disconfirmed his theory, he quipped, “Then I would have felt sorry for the dear Lord. The theory is accurate.”

Einstein's jokey response reminds us that physicists often take the name of “the dear Lord” in vain. In fact, one should, as a general rule, be wary of the supposed “God talk” of theoretical physicists. Often when they speak of God or, as in Einstein’s case, “die Alte,” the Old One, they don’t intend to be saying anything of supernatural consequence. Instead they’re engaging in a rather playful way of expressing personal intuitions regarding the objective nature of reality – the way that things really are, not from the human point of view, but rather as they are in themselves, from no point of view at all. Such a conception of objectivity is what philosophers sometimes refer to as “the view from nowhere” or what the philosopher Spinoza called the view sub specie aeternitatis – that is, under the guise of eternity.

Left: Detail from Baruch Spinoza Opera posthuma, Amsterdam: Jan Rieuwertsz, 1677.
Christie's, 23 April 2001, lot 181.
There is, in this way of speech, no presumption that we can succeed in transcending our human limitations so that we can attain the purely objective point of view. In fact, those who employ “God talk” as a way of speaking of objectivity are intentionally gesturing toward the vast distance between our human knowledge and the way things really are. And Einstein, who often expressed the view that our best achievements in science, as exhilarating and transformative as they can be, only yield a small glimpse into the vast lawful structure of nature, was much prone to “God talk.”

So, for example, when he famously said that “God does not play dice with the universe” he wasn’t expressing any belief in God – not even a deist belief that there is a God who limited his activity to creating the laws of nature and then turned his back, never more to interfere in the world’s happenings. No, he was rather colorfully expressing his intuition that quantum mechanics, with its stochastic laws, is not meant to be the last word in physics. A more complete description, he believed, would eventually restore the causal determinism to our picture of the universe. The topic of his seeming assertion concerning God’s distaste for games of chance falls strictly within the realm of physics, and nowhere near theology.

But sometimes Einstein, in speaking of God, truly was addressing himself to theological matters, about which he was often questioned. It stood to reason, once he had been declared the peerless thinker of his age, that he would be plied with all the questions that most baffle us: Is there free will? Is there an objective basis for morality? Is there an afterlife? And, of course, is there a God?

His answer to the last question was most often answered by his invoking the name of the seventeenth-century Dutch philosopher Baruch Spinoza. “I believe in Spinoza’s God,” was what he answered time and again. So, for example, when an Orthodox rabbi in New York City caught wind of the unorthodox religious views of the physicist in Berlin, he sent him a peremptory telegraph: “Do you believe in God? Stop. Answer paid. 50 words.” The rabbi overpaid. Einstein used little more than half his allotted number of words in the response which was to become the most famous version of the answer he so often gave: “I believe in Spinoza’s God, who reveals himself in the lawful harmony of all that exists, but not in a God who concerns himself with the fate and the doings of mankind.”
So obviously, if we want to know what it was that Einstein believed about God we have to look a bit more deeply into Spinoza’s subtle views. It is easier to enumerate the views Spinoza rejected, which happened to be all the most fundamental tenets of what he non-diplomatically called “the superstitious religions.” He denied the logical possibility of a God who can enter into human history, who can perform miracles, who can appear to prophets. He denied the logical possibility of a God who could, by way of his commandments, lay down the moral law for us. He denied the logical possibility of a God who could choose to bring the universe, together with its laws of nature, into being. He denied the logical possibility of a God who could have any will or intentions whatsoever. For Spinoza, each one of the tenets he denied rendered the universe unintelligible. And if there was one intuition to which Spinoza was whole-heartedly committed it was the intelligibility of the universe. For Spinoza, it isn’t turtles all the way down; it’s reasons all the way down.

And so, for Spinoza, the only sense we can give to the word “God” is to identify it with the very intelligibility of the universe, with the laws that govern nature and explain all that happens within it. It’s the physical universe itself, and not any being that transcends it, that must provide the ultimate answers regarding the universe, including why it exists at all.

For Spinoza, as later for Einstein, this final explanation of the universe by the universe almost certainly lies beyond our human capabilities. But that is a statement about our limitations, not those of the universe. The reason for why the universe is the way it is, for why it had to be that way, lies in the ultimate laws of nature. But there’s no guarantee that those ultimate laws are knowable to us.

Spinoza’s views about God are set forth in an extraordinary work, written in the style of Euclidean proofs, which is simply entitled The Ethics. He is declaring, in his title, that we no more need a transcendent God to establish the basis for morality than we need a transcendent God in order to know why there is something rather than nothing. The ethics that Spinoza deduces is thoroughly naturalist, supervening not on claims concerning God’s intentions but concerning human nature.
In Spinoza's Gedichte:

Wie liebt der dieser edle Mann
Mehr als sich mit Worten sagen kann.
Doch freut sich, dass er bleibt allein
Mit seinem strahlenden Heiligensehen.

Er ist für mehr als seinen Kost
Der führt ihn zu der Trähe nicht
Der flieht ihn, lässt ihm nicht
Das Leben zieht ihm mit Gewalt.

Die Höhe bringt ihm nichts als Trost
Verwirrt ist für ihn seine Kost
Besitz und Weib und 'Els' und Hans
Das fällt ihm von oben bis unten aus.

Du musst schon gottlich mir verliehen
Wenn hier mir fällt Münchhausen ein.
Denn als Einziger das Kunststück gediehen
Sich aus eigener Zopf aus dem Schaf zu ziehen.

So derkt der
Daß derkt (Später)
Beispiel zeigt es eben
diese Lehe dem Menschen kann geben
In seinem Leben, was fällt ihm ein?

Zum Nachfragen muss man geboren sein!
Zuerst die Tod dem Kröpelichen Lachen:
Zum Erhebenen muss man geboren sein.
Spinoza wasn’t able to publish The Ethics while he lived; it would have been too dangerous. A group of his friends saw to its publication on the one-year anniversary of his death. The book went on to have a remarkable history. It was everywhere excoriated but also widely read. In fact, so notorious did Spinoza’s reputation grow that prepared denunciations of his views became a prerequisite for entrance into the academic and ecclesiastical ranks. By 1710 there had been assembled in Leipzig an extensive Catalogus scriptorum Anti-Spinozanorum.

Perhaps it wasn’t altogether advisable for the religious and academic authorities to require that those seeking admittance to their ranks carefully consider Spinoza in order to know how to refute him, since, for some, the study led to persuasion. An underground devotion to Spinoza gradually gathered strength internationally, a significant factor in the eventual emergence of what would come to be called the European Enlightenment, most especially in its more radical forms: rejecting the traditional forms of authority, both religious and civic; promoting reason and science over religious dogma and republicanism over monarchy.

Not the least of the remarkable consequences of the posthumous publication of The Ethics is the effect that the work had on the greatest physicist of the twentieth century, who expressed his admiration for the philosopher not only directly — including in a gushing poem he wrote, Zu Spinozas Ethik — but indirectly in the answers he consistently gave to the philosophical questions he was asked.

“It seems to me that the ideas of a personal God is an anthropological concept which I cannot take seriously. I feel also not able to imagine some will or goal outside the human sphere. My views are near those of Spinoza: admiration for the beauty of, and belief in, the logical simplicity of the order which we can grasp humbly and only imperfectly. I believe that we have to content ourselves with our imperfect knowledge and understanding and treat values and moral obligations as a purely human problem — the most important of all human problems” (Letter to Murray W. Gross, 26 April 1947).

Einstein’s “God letter” is certainly in line with everything we know about Einstein’s religious views by his having consistently assimilated Spinoza into his responses. We know that Einstein rejected any notion of a transcendent God to whose will we can appeal in explaining the existence of the universe and the basis of morality. But the letter adds something more, and that something more is precious, giving us a glimpse into the emotional and moral character of Einstein.

In the present letter Einstein both acknowledges his identity as a Jew, even claiming that this identity explains certain features of his mentality, while he also expresses impatience with any kind of group chauvinism. This rejection of group-glorification is also much in line with Spinoza, who, I ought to mention, managed to get himself permanently excommunicated from his own Jewish community of Amsterdam at the tender age of 24.
The kind of objectivity that both Spinoza and Einstein revered requires that one be rigorously objective about one’s own self, which requires objectivity toward one’s own group. A person can both identify as an X without claiming any special glory or innate superiority in being an X. In fact, one not only can, but ought to. No group is immune to the general laws that govern all of nature, including human nature, as “our wonderful Spinoza” was the first to recognize. And this particular moral obligation to regard one’s own group with rigorous objectivity, as psychologically difficult as it has proven itself to be (no matter the X), is what Einstein is asserting in “the God letter.” (Perhaps it would better be dubbed “the anti-tribalism letter.”)

And yet, while there are notes of exasperation in his letter to Eric Gutkind, these notes are muffled in the sweet gracefulness with which Einstein takes care to assure the author of Choose Life: The Biblical Call to Revolt of his ultimate respect for him. Uncompromising intellectual integrity is paired with great care not to wound the dignity of another. And in this pairing, the letter manifests the character trait that Spinoza had praised beyond all others, namely the “high-mindedness” that, while seeing others’ profound errors, also sees the human frailty behind the errors while gently seeking to correct them, bearing always in mind “the good which follows from mutual friendships and common fellowships” (The Ethics, Part V, Proposition X, Note).

References

Einstein Letter

Mr. Eric B. Gutkind
The Master Hotel
310 Riverside Drive
New York 25, N.Y.
CONDITIONS OF SALE • BUYING AT CHRISTIE’S

CONDITIONS OF SALE

These Conditions of Sale and the Important Notices and Explanation of Catologuing Practice set out the terms on which we offer the lots listed in this catalogue for sale. By registering to bid and/or by bidding at auction you agree to these terms, so you should read them carefully before doing so. You will find a glossary at the end explaining the meaning of the words and expressions coloured in bold.

Unles we own a lot in whole or in part (See §2), Christie’s acts as agent for the seller.

A BEFORE THE SALE

1 DESCRIPTION OF LOTS

(a) Certain words used in the catalogue description have special meanings. You can find details of these on the page headed “Important Notices and Explanation of Catologuing Practice” which forms part of these terms. You can find a key to the Symbols found next to certain catalogue entries under the section of the catalogue called “Symbols Used in this Catalogue.”

(b) Our description of any lot in the catalogue, any condition report and any other statement made by us (whether orally or in writing) about any lot, including any about its nature or condition, artist, period, materials, approximate dimensions, or provenance are our opinion and not to be relied upon as a statement of fact. For the avoidance of doubt, we do not carry out in-depth research of the sort carried out by professional historians and scholars. All dimensions and weights are approximate only.

2 OUR RESPONSIBILITY FOR OUR DESCRIPTION OF LOTS

We provide any guarantees in relation to the nature of a lot apart from our authenticity warranty included in paragraph E2 and to the extent provided in paragraph 1 below.

3 CONDITION

(a) The condition of lots sold in our auctions can vary widely due to factors such as age, previous damage, restoration, repair and wear and tear. Their nature means that they will rarely be in perfect condition. Lots are sold “as is,” in the condition they are in at the time of the sale, without any representations or warranty or assumption of liability of any kind to condition by Christie’s or by the seller.

(b) Any reference to condition in a catalogue entry or in a condition report will not amount to a full description of condition, and images may not show all faults, inherent defects, restoration, alteration or adaptation because our staff are not professional restorers or conservators. For that reason condition reports are not an alternative to examining a lot in person or seeking your own professional advice. It is your responsibility to ensure that you have requested, received and considered any condition report.

4 VIEWING LOTS PEO-AUCTION

(a) If you are planning to bid on a lot, you should inspect it personally or through a knowledgeable representative before you make a bid to make sure that you accept the description and its condition.

(b) Pre-auction viewings are open to the public free of charge. Our specialists may be available to answer questions at pre-auction viewings or by appointment.

5 ESTIMATES

Estimates are based on the condition, rarity, and provenance of the lot and on prices recently paid at auction for similar property.

6 WITHDRAWAL

Christie’s may, at its option, withdraw any lot from auction at any time prior to or during the sale of the lot. Christie’s has no liability to you for any decision to withdraw.

(b) We may also ask you to give us a financial reference and/or a deposit as a condition of allowing you to bid. For help, please contact our Credit Department at +1 212-656-2490.

2 RETURNING BIDDERS

As described in paragraph B(1) above, we may at our option ask you for the following: a financial reference, or a deposit as a condition of allowing you to bid. If you have not bought anything from any of our salesrooms within the last two years or if you want to spend more than on previous occasions, please contact our Credit Department at +1 212-656-2490.

3 IF YOU FAIL TO PROVIDE THE RIGHT DOCUMENTS

If in our opinion you do not satisfy our bidder identification and registration procedures including, but not limited to complying any anti-money laundering and/or anti-terrorism financing checks we may require to our satisfaction, we may refuse to register you to bid, and if you make a successful bid, we may cancel the contract for sale between you and the seller.

4 BIDDING ON BEHALF OF ANOTHER PERSON

If you are planning to bid on a lot, you will need to register for a written bid for the relevant sale site. If no written bid is submitted, you will be bound by the lowest bid submitted by you for the lot.

5 BIDDING IN PERSON

If you wish to bid in the saleroom you must register for a numbered bidding paddle at least 30 minutes before the auction. You can find a Written Bid Form at the back of our catalogue. For more information, please visit www.christies.com or contact Christie’s LIVE™ Terms of Use which are available online.

6 BIDDING SERVICES

The buying services described below are a free service offered as a convenience to our clients and Christie’s is not responsible for any error (human or otherwise), omission or breakdown in providing these services.

(a) Phone Bids

Your request for this service must be made no later than 24 hours prior to the auction. We will accept bids by telephone for lots only if they are accompanied by a telephone bid card.

(b) Internet Bids on Christie’s LIVE™

Christie’s will not be liable for any bids you make by telephone or through Christie’s LIVE™. We recommend you get your own advice from a professional before placing any bids through Christie’s LIVE™.

(c) Written Bids

You can find a Written Bid Form at the back of our catalogues, at any Christie's office, or by choosing the ‘Online Bidding’ option on the Christie's website. We cannot be bound by any rate of exchange used. Christie’s is not responsible for any error (human or otherwise), omission or breakdown in providing these services.

7 CURRENCY CONVERTER

The saleroom video screens (and Christie’s LIVE™) may show bids in some other major currencies as well as US dollars. Any conversion is for guidance only and cannot be bound by any rate of exchange used. Christie’s is not responsible for any error (human or otherwise), omission or breakdown in providing these services.

8 SUCCESSFUL BIDS

Unless the auctioneer decides to use his or her discretion as set out in paragraph C3 above, when the auctioneer's hammer strikes, we have accepted the last bid. This means a contract for sale has been formed between the seller and the successful bidder. We will issue an invoice to you, the successful bidder, within twelve working days of the successful bid. While we send out invoices by mail and/or email after the auction, we do not accept responsibility for any loss of or damage to your invoice even if you have had your bid won. If you have won your bid by telephone, you should contact us by telephone or in person as soon as possible after the auction to get details of the outcome of your bid to ensure you pay any necessary storage charges.

9 LOCAL BIDDING LAWS

You agree that when bidding in any of our sales you will strictly comply with all local laws and regulations in force at the time of the sale for the relevant sale site.

C AT THE SALE

1 WHO CAN ENTER THE AUCTION

We may, at our option, refuse admission to our premises or decline to permit participation in any auction to any person or persons.

2 RESERVES

Unless otherwise indicated, all lots are subject to a reserve.

3 AUCTIONEER’S DISCRETION

The auctioneer can at his or her sole option: 

(a) refuse admission to any person;

(b) move the bidding backwards or forwards in any way he or she may decide, or change the order of the lots;

(c) withdraw any lot;

(d) divide any lot or combine any two or more lots;

(e) reopen or continue the bidding after the hammer has fallen; and

(f) in the case of error or dispute and whether during or after the auction, to continue the bidding, determine the successful bidder, cancel the sale of the lot, or reoffer and resell the lot. If any dispute relating to bidding arises during or after the auction, the auctioneer’s decision in exercise of this option is final.

4 BIDDING

The auctioneer accepts bids from: 

(a) bidders in the saleroom;

(b) telephone bidders;

(c) internet bidders through Christie’s LIVE™ (as shown above in paragraph B); and

(d) written bids (also known as absentee bids or commission bids) left with us by a bidder before the auction.

5 BIDDING ON BEHALF OF THE SELLER

The auctioneer may, at his or her sole option, bid on behalf of the seller up to but not including the amount of the reserve to make consecutive bids or by making bids in response to other bidders. The auctioneer will not identify these bids made on behalf of the seller and will not disclose any bid on behalf of the seller at or above the reserve. If lots are offered without reserve, the auctioneer will generally decide to open the bidding at 50% of the low estimate for the lot. If no bid is made at the time the hammer falls, the auctioneer may decide to go backwards at his or her sole option until a bid is made, and then continue up from that amount. In the case of a lot sold on a lot, the auctioneer may determine such lot unsold.

6 BID INCREMENTS

Bidding generally starts below the low estimate and increases in steps (bid increments). The auctioneer will decide at his or her sole option where the bidding should start and the bid increments. The usual bid increments are shown for guidance only on the Written Bid Form at the back of this catalogue.

7 CURRENCY CONVERTER

The saleroom video screens (and Christie’s LIVE™) may show bids in some other major currencies as well as US dollars. Any conversion is for guidance only and cannot be bound by any rate of exchange used. Christie’s is not responsible for any error (human or otherwise), omission or breakdown in providing these services.

8 SUCCESSFUL BIDS

Unless the auctioneer decides to use his or her discretion as set out in paragraph C3 above, when the auctioneer's hammer strikes, we have accepted the last bid. This means a contract for sale has been formed between the seller and the successful bidder. We will issue an invoice to you, the successful bidder, within twelve working days of the successful bid. While we send out invoices by mail and/or email after the auction, we do not accept responsibility for any loss of or damage to your invoice even if you have won your bid. If you have won your bid by telephone, you should contact us by telephone or in person as soon as possible after the auction to get details of the outcome of your bid to ensure you pay any necessary storage charges.

9 LOCAL BIDDING LAWS

You agree that when bidding in any of our sales you will strictly comply with all local laws and regulations in force at the time of the sale for the relevant sale site.
D THE BUYER’S PREMIUM AND TAXES

1 THE BUYER’S PREMIUM

In addition to the hammer price, the successful bidder agrees to pay for a “buyer’s premium” at the rate of 25% of each lot sold. On all lots we charge 2.5% of the hammer price up to and including US$5,000, 20% on that part of the hammer price over US$5,000 up to and including US$10,000, and 12.5% of that part of the hammer price above US$10,000.

2 TAXES

The successful bidder is responsible for any applicable taxes including any sales or use or tax equivalent tax whenever such taxes may arise on the hammer price, the buyer’s premium, and/or any other charges related to the lot. For lots Christie’s ships to or within the United States, a sales tax may be levied by any state or local taxing authority, buyer’s premium, and/or any other charges related to the lot, regardless of the nationality or citizenship of the successful bidder. Christie’s will collect sales tax where legally required. The applicable sales tax rate will be determined based upon the state, county, or locale to which the lot will be shipped. Christie’s shall collect New York sales tax at a rate of 8.875% for any lot collected from Christie’s in New York. In accordance with New York law, if Christie’s arranges the shipment of a lot out of New York State, New York sales tax does not apply, although sales tax or other applicable taxes for other states may apply. If you have a shipper (other than a common carrier authorized by Christie’s to collect the lot) that is not a New York State licensed seller, Christie’s will collect New York sales tax on the lot at a rate of 8.875% regardless of the ultimate destination of the lot. If Christie’s delivers the lot to, or the lot is collected by, any carrier, restorer or other service provider in New York that you have hired, New York law considers the lot delivered out of New York and New York sales tax must be imposed regardless of the ultimate destination of the lot. In this circumstance, New York sales tax will apply to the lot even if Christie’s or a common carrier (authorized by Christie’s that you hire) subsequently delivers the lot to you.

Successful bidders claiming an exemption from sales tax must provide appropriate documentation to Christie’s prior to the release of the lot or within 90 days after the sale, whichever is earlier. If, when you sign the catalog, you represent that you are one of these states for which Christie’s is not required to collect sales tax, a successful bidder may have a use or tax obligation. It is the successful bidder’s responsibility to pay all tax due. Christie’s recommends you consult your own independent tax advisor with any questions.

E SELLER’S WARRANTIES

For each lot, the seller gives a warranty that the seller: (a) is the owner of the lot or a joint owner of the lot acting with the permission of the other co-owners; or, if the seller is not the owner or a joint owner of the lot, has the permission of the owner to sell the lot; (b) has the right to do so in law; and (c) has the right to transfer ownership of the lot to the buyer without any restrictions or claims by anyone else. If either of the above warranties are incorrect, the seller shall not have to pay more than the purchase price (as defined in paragraph F(1) below) paid by you to us. The seller shall not be responsible for any reason for loss of profits or business, expected savings, loss of opportunity or interest, costs, damages, other damages or expenses. The seller gives no warranty in relation to any sale or lot other than as set out above. As the seller is allowed by law, all warranties from the seller to you, and all other obligations upon the seller which may be added to this agreement by law, are excluded.

2 OUR AUTHENTICITY WARRANTY

We warrant, subject to the terms below, that the lots in our sales are genuine (our “authenticity warranty”). If, within 5 years of the date of the auction, you give notice to us that your lot is not authentic, subject to the terms and conditions of paragraph F, we will refund the purchase price paid by you. The meaning of authentic can be found in the glossary at the end of these Conditions of Sale. The terms of the authenticity warranty are as follows:

(a) It is offered for claim as genuine whether and for a period of 5 years from the date of the auction. After such time, we will not be obligated to honor the authenticity warranty.

(b) It is given only for information shown in UPPERCASE type in the first line of the catalogue description (the “Heading”). It does not apply to any information other than in the Heading, even if shown in UPPERCASE type.

(c) The authenticity warranty does not apply to any Heading or part of a Heading if a qualified condition is set out in a qualified section of the lot’s catalogue description or if the heading is not amended as set forth in paragraph 1 of the conditions of Sale. In any such case, if you make a claim for authenticity, we shall only refund the purchase price paid by you if Christie’s determines by law, if any deposit or other part-payment which you have paid to us.

(d) (i) We can reject at any future auction any bids made by or on behalf of the buyer to obtain a deposit on any lots you may have made to or, which we, on your request to you or to another Christie’s Group company, we can use or deal with any of your property we may owe you (including any deposit or other part-payment which you have paid to us); or (ii) you can get from our Post-Sale Services. You must send your completed CNP authorisation form by fax at +1 212 636 4190 or you can mail to the address below. Details of the conditions and restrictions applicable to credit card payments are available from our Post-Sale Services, whose details are set out in paragraph G below.

(e) Cash

(i) We do not accept cash payments (including money orders and traveller’s cheques) subject to a maximum global aggregate of US$7,500 per sale at our Post-Sale Services Office.

(ii) Bank Checks

You must make these payable to Christie’s Inc. and there may be conditions.

(f) Wire transfer

You must make payment to Christie’s Inc. and understand that Christie’s will have all of your proceeds of the sale and we will pay any amount left from that sale to you. If there is a shortfall, you must pay any difference between the amount we have received from the sale and the amount you owe us.

G COLLECTION AND STORAGE

(a) You must collect purchased lots within seven days from the auction (but note that lots will not be released to you until you have made full and clear payment of the purchase price due to us).

(b) Information on collecting lots is set out on the storage and collection page and on an information sheet which will be given to the bidder repaying staff or Christie’s Post-Sale Services Department on +1 212 636 2650.

(c) If you do not collect any lot within thirty days following the auction, at our discretion we may charge you storage costs at the rates set out at www.christies.com/storage.

In your case, such costs are subject to Christie’s location or an affiliate or third party warehouse and you will either have to give us prior notice of your intentions to pay for your storage costs, or we may transfer to another Christie’s location or an affiliate or third party warehouse and you will be liable for any costs incurred by us in doing so and you will be subject to the third party storage costs and for any reasonable charges and for your standard fees and costs.

(h) sell the lot in any commercially reasonable way at any sale of any kind that we may choose to hold.

(i) The Storage conditions which can be found at www.christies.com/storage will apply.

(j) New York law, you have paid for the lot in full but you do not collect the lot within 180 calendar days of payment, we may charge you New York sales tax for the lot.

(k) Nothing in this paragraph is intended to limit our rights under paragraph F4.
H TRANSPORT AND SHIPPING

1 SHIPPING

We will enclose a transport and shipping form with each invoice sent to you. You must make all transport and shipping arrangements. However, we can arrange to pack, transport, and ship your property if you ask us to do so and pay the costs of doing so. We recommend that you ask us for an estimate, especially for large items or items of high value that need professional packing. We may also suggest other handlers, packers, transporters, or experts if you ask us to do so. For more information, please contact Christie’s International Plc. at 212 636 2650. See the information set out at www.christies.com/shipping or contact us at PostSaleUS@christies.com. We will take reasonable care of your property when we are handling, packing, transporting, and shipping. However, if we recommend another company for any of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, failure to act, or neglect.

2 EXPORT AND IMPORT

Any lot sold at auction may be affected by laws on exports from the country in which it is sold and the import restrictions of other countries. Many countries require a declaration of export for property leaving the country and/or an import declaration on entry of exports from the country in which it is sold and the failure to act, or neglect of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, handling, packing, transporting, and shipping. However, if we recommend another company for any of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, failure to act, or neglect.

212 636 2650. See the information set out at www.christies.com/shipping or contact us at PostSaleUS@christies.com. We will take reasonable care of your property when we are handling, packing, transporting, and shipping. However, if we recommend another company for any of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, failure to act, or neglect.

3 COPYRIGHT

We own the copyright in all images, illustrations and written material produced by or for us relating to a lot (including the contents of our catalogues unless otherwise stated) and therefore are the first and/or sole owners of the copyright in the work of any nature created by us in connection with the lot and in doing so. We do not offer any guarantee that you will gain any copyright or other reproduction rights to the lot.

4 ENFORCING THIS AGREEMENT

If a court finds that any part of this agreement is not valid or illegal or impossible to enforce, then that part of the agreement will be treated as being deleted and the rest of this agreement will not be affected.

5 TRANSFERRING YOUR RIGHTS AND RESPONSIBILITIES

You may not grant a security over or transfer your rights or responsibilities under these terms on the transfer of the property to the buyer unless we have given our written permission. That permission will be binding on your successors or estate and anyone who takes over your rights and responsibilities.

6 TRANSLATIONS

If we have provided a translation of this agreement, we will use this original version in deciding any issues or disputes which arise under this agreement.

7 PERSONAL INFORMATION

We will hold and process your personal information and may pass it to another Christie’s Group company for use described in, and in line with, our privacy notice at www.christies.com/about-us/contact/privacy. You may contact us at info@christies.com to request access to, or a copy of, personal information we hold about you. You may also request correction, updating and restriction of your personal information, or to request us to erase your personal information at www.christies.com/about-us/contact/privacy. We will use and process personal information for the following purposes: to enter into and perform our agreement with you; to contact you; to keep you up to date with our services; to carry out and improve our activities; and to comply with our legal obligations. Our processing of personal information takes place both in the United Kingdom and in countries with different data protection laws. We will retain your personal information for the duration of our agreement with you. We may retain your personal information in accordance with our Privacy Policy at www.christies.com/about-us/contact/privacy.

K GLOSSARY

authentic: authentic: a genuine example, rather than a copy or forgery of...

authenticity warranty: the guarantee we give in this agreement that a lot is authentic as set out in paragraph F3.7(b).

buyer’s premium: the charge the buyer pays along with the hammer price.

catalogue description: the description of a lot in the catalogue for the auction, as amended by any saleroom notice.

Christie’s Group: Christie’s International Plc, its subsidiaries and other companies within its corporate group.

country of origin: the country in which something was made.

country of origin: the country in which some property was made, such as 'gold' and may be refused import into those countries.

country of origin: the country and/or an import declaration on entry of exports from the country in which it is sold and the failure to act, or neglect of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, handling, packing, transporting, and shipping. However, if we recommend another company for any of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, failure to act, or neglect.

country of origin: the country in which something was made, such as 'gold' and may be refused import into those countries.

country of origin: the country and/or an import declaration on entry of exports from the country in which it is sold and the failure to act, or neglect of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, handling, packing, transporting, and shipping. However, if we recommend another company for any of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, failure to act, or neglect.

country of origin: the country in which something was made, such as 'gold' and may be refused import into those countries.

country of origin: the country and/or an import declaration on entry of exports from the country in which it is sold and the failure to act, or neglect of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, handling, packing, transporting, and shipping. However, if we recommend another company for any of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, failure to act, or neglect.

country of origin: the country in which something was made, such as 'gold' and may be refused import into those countries.

country of origin: the country and/or an import declaration on entry of exports from the country in which it is sold and the failure to act, or neglect of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, handling, packing, transporting, and shipping. However, if we recommend another company for any of these purposes, we are not responsible for their acts, failure to act, or neglect.
Christie’s has a direct financial interest in the lot.
See Important Notices and Explanation of Cataloguing Practice.

Δ
Owned by Christie’s or another Christie’s Group company in whole or part. See Important Notices and Explanation of Cataloguing Practice.

◊
Christie’s has a direct financial interest in the lot and has funded all or part of our interest with the help of someone else. See Important Notices and Explanation of Cataloguing Practice.

•
Lot offered without reserve which will be sold to the highest bidder regardless of the pre-sale estimate in the catalogue.

Lot incorporates material from endangered species which could result in export restrictions. See Paragraph H2(b) of the Conditions of Sale.

See Storage and Collection pages in the catalogue.

Ψ
Lot incorporates material from endangered species that is not for sale and shown for display purposes only. See Paragraph H2(g) of the Conditions of Sale.

Please note that lots are marked as a convenience to you and we shall not be liable for any errors in, or failure to, mark a lot.

18/05/17
STORAGE AND COLLECTION

PAYMENT OF ANY CHARGES DUE

Specified lots (sold and unsold) marked with a filled square (■) not collected from Christie’s by 5:00pm on the day of the sale will, at our option, be removed to Christie’s Fine Art Storage Services (CFASS in Red Hook, Brooklyn). Christie’s will inform you if the lot has been sent offsite.

If the lot is transferred to Christie’s Fine Art Storage Services, it will be available for collection after the third business day following the sale.

Please contact Christie’s Post-Sale Service 24 hours in advance to book a collection time at Christie’s Fine Art Services. All collections from Christie’s Fine Art Services will be by pre-booked appointment only.

Please be advised that after 50 days from the auction date property may be moved at Christie’s discretion. Please contact Post-Sale Services to confirm the location of your property prior to collection.

Tel: +1 212 636 2650
Email: PostSaleUS@christies.com
Operation hours for both Christie’s Rockefeller and Christie’s Fine Art Storage are from 9:30 am to 5:00 pm, Monday – Friday.

COLLECTION AND CONTACT DETAILS

Lots will only be released on payment of all charges due and on production of a Collection Form from Christie’s. Charges may be paid in advance or at the time of collection. We may charge fees for storage if your lot is not collected within thirty days from the sale. Please see paragraph G of the Conditions of Sale for further detail.

Tel: +1 212 636 2650
Email: PostSaleUS@christies.com

SHIPPING AND DELIVERY

Christie’s Post-Sale Service can organize domestic deliveries or international freight. Please contact them on +1 212 636 2650 or PostSaleUS@christies.com.

Long-term storage solutions are also available per client request. CFASS is a separate subsidiary of Christie’s and clients enjoy complete confidentiality. Please contact CFASS New York for details and rates: +1 212 636 2070 or storage@cfass.com

STREET MAP OF CHRISTIE’S NEW YORK LOCATIONS

Christie’s Rockefeller Center
20 Rockefeller Plaza, New York 10020
Tel: +1 212 636 2000
nycollections@christies.com
Main Entrance on 49th Street
Receiving/Shipping Entrance on 48th Street
Hours: 9.30 AM - 5.00 PM
Monday-Friday except Public Holidays

Christie’s Fine Art Storage Services (CFASS)
62-100 Imlay Street, Brooklyn, NY 11231
Tel: +1 212 974 4500
nycollections@christies.com
Main Entrance on Corner of Imlay and Bowne St
Hours: 9.30 AM - 5.00 PM
Monday-Friday except Public Holidays
## WORLDWIDE SALEROOMS AND OFFICES AND SERVICES

### ARGENTINA
- BUENOS AIRES: (+54) 11 4330 4222
- Cristina Carlisle

### AUSTRALIA
- SYDNEY: (+61) 02 9326 1422
- Ronan Sulich

### AUSTRIA
- VIENNA: (+43) 1 533 881214
- Angela Baillou

### BELGIUM
- BRUSSELS: (+32) 02 612 88 30
- Roland de Lathuy

### BRAZIL
- SÃO PAULO: (+55 21) 3500 8944
- Marina Bertoldi

### CANADA
- TORONTO: (+1) 416 519 0957
- Brett Sherlock (Consultant)

### CHILE
- SANTIAGO: (+56 2) 2361364
- Denise Ratinoff de Lira

### COLOMBIA
- BOGOTA: (+57) 635 54 00
- Juanita Madrany (Independent Consultant)

### DENMARK
- COPENHAGEN: (+45) 3862 2277
- Birgitta Hillingsø (Consultant)
- (+45) 2612 0092
- Rikke Juul Brandt (Consultant)

### FINLAND
- AND THE BALTIC STATES:
  - HELSINKI: +358 40 5837945
- Barbro Schauman (Consultant)

### FRANCE
- BRITTANY AND THE LOIRE VALLEY: (+33) 06 09 14 10 78
- Virginie Gregory (Consultant)

### GERMANY
- DÜSSELDORF: (+49) 201 49 352
- Arno Verkade

### HOLLAND
- AMSTERDAM: (+31) 020 57 55 295
- Arno Verkade

### INDIA
- MUMBAI: (+91) 22 2875 7095
- Sonal Singh

### INDONESIA
- JAKARTA: (+62) 21 7287 6268
- Charnie Hamami

### ISRAEL
- TEL AVIV: (+972) 01 695 0695
- Roni Gilat-Baharaf

### ITALY
- MILAN: (+39) 02 303 2831
- Cristiano De Lorenzo

### NORWAY
- OSLO: (+47) 49 89 29 24
- Corinna Svedman (Consultant)

### PORTUGAL
- LISBON: (+351) 919 37 233
- Malakka Pereira Coutinho (Consultant)

### RUSSIA
- MOSCOW: (+7 495) 6364
- +44 20 7389 2318
- Zain Talyarkhan

### SINGAPORE
- (+65) 6735 1766
- Nicole Lee

### SOUTH AFRICA
- CAPE TOWN: (+27) 21 761 2676
- Juliet Lomberg (Independent Consultant)

### SWITZERLAND
- GENEVA: (+41) 22 319 1766
- Eveline de Proyat

### TAIWAN
- TAIPEI: (+886) 2 2736 3356
- Ada Ong

### THAILAND
- BANGKOK: (+66) 02 652 0793
- Benjawan Urapirovan

### TURKEY
- ISTANBUL: (+90) 212 798 7514
- Eda Kehal Edin Arşın (Consultant)

### UNITED ARAB EMIRATES
- DUBAI: (+971) 04 425 5647

### UNITED KINGDOM
- LONDON: (+44) 020 7839 9060

### UNITED STATES
- NEW YORK: (+1) 212 355 1501
- Email: christieseducation@christies.edu

### OTHER SERVICES
- CHRISTIE’S EDUCATION
  - New York: (+1) 212 355 1501
  - Email: christieseducation@christies.edu
  - Hong Kong: (+852) 2978 6768
  - Email: hko@christies.com

### CHRISTIE’S INTERNATIONAL REAL ESTATE
- NEW YORK: (+1) 212 468 7182
- Email: info@christiesrealstate.com

### CHRISTIE’S FINE ART STORAGE SERVICES
- NEW YORK: (+1) 212 974 4579
- New York: newyork@cfass.com
- Singapore: +65 6543 5252
- Email: singapore@cfass.com
- CHRISTIE’S REDSTONE
  - NEW YORK: (+1) 212 974 4500

---

### AUCTION SERVICES

### CHRISTIE’S AUCTION ESTIMATES
- Tel: (+1) 212 468 7141
- Email: awhiting@christies.com

### CORPORATE COLLECTIONS
- Tel: (+1) 212 636 2464
- Fax: (+1) 212 636 4929
- Email: gsdillow@christies.com

### ESTATES AND APPRAISALS
- Tel: (+1) 212 636 2400
- Fax: (+1) 212 636 2370
- Email: info@christies.com

### MUSEUM SERVICES
- Tel: (+1) 212 636 2620
- Fax: (+1) 212 636 4931
- Email: awhiting@christies.com

### DENOTES SALEROOM

### ENQUIRIES
- Call the Saleroom or Office

### EMAIL
- info@christies.com

For a complete salerooms & offices listing go to christies.com

---

26/03/18
YOUR CAREER IN THE ART WORLD STARTS HERE
ALBERT EINSTEIN: THE GOD LETTER
TUESDAY 4 DECEMBER 2018
AT 2.00 PM
20 Rockefeller Plaza
New York, NY 10020
CODE NAME: BARUCH
SALE NUMBER: 16393
(Dealers billing name and address must agree with tax exemption certificate. Invoices cannot be changed after they have been printed.)

BID ONLINE FOR THIS SALE AT CHRISTIES.COM

WRITTEN BIDS FORM
CHRISTIE'S NEW YORK

Written bids must be received at least 24 hours before the auction begins. Christie’s will confirm all bids received by fax by return fax. If you have not received confirmation within one business day, please contact the Bid Department. Tel: +1 212 636 2437 on-line www.christies.com

1. I request Christie’s to bid on the stated lots up to the maximum bid I have indicated for each lot.

2. I understand that if my bid is successful the amount payable will be the sum of the hammer price and the buyer’s premium (together with any applicable state or local sales or use taxes chargeable on the hammer price and buyer’s premium) in accordance with the Conditions of Sale—Buyer’s Agreement). The buyer’s premium rate shall be an amount equal to 25% of the hammer price of each lot up to and including US$250,000, 20% on any amount over US$250,000 up to and including US$1,000,000 and 15% of the amount above US$1,000,000.

3. I agree to be bound by the Conditions of Sale printed in the catalogue.

4. I understand that if Christie’s receive written bids on a lot for identical amounts and at the auction these are the highest bids on the lot, Christie’s will sell the lot to the bidder whose written bid it received and accepted first.

5. Written bids submitted on “no reserve” lots will, in the absence of a higher bid, be executed at approximately 50% of the low estimate or at the amount of the bid if it is less than 50% of the low estimate.

I understand that Christie’s written bid service is a free service provided for clients and that, while Christie’s will be as careful as it reasonably can be, Christie’s will not be liable for any problems with this service or loss or damage arising from circumstances beyond Christie’s reasonable control.

AUCTION RESULTS: CHRISTIES.COM

BIDDING INCREMENTS
Bidding generally starts below the low estimate and increases in steps (bid increments) of up to 10 per cent. The auctioneer will decide where the bidding should start and the bid increments. Written bids that do not conform to the increments set below may be lowered to the next bidding-interval.

- US$100 to US$2,000: by US$100s
- US$2,000 to US$3,000: by US$200s
- US$3,000 to US$5,000: by US$500s
- (e.g. US$4,200, 4,500, 4,800)
- US$5,000 to US$10,000: by US$500s
- US$10,000 to US$20,000: by US$1,000s
- US$20,000 to US$30,000: by US$2,000s
- US$30,000 to US$50,000: by US$5,000s
- (e.g. US$45,000, 50,000, 55,000)
- US$50,000 to US$100,000: by US$5,000s
- US$100,000 to US$200,000: by US$10,000s
- Above US$200,000: at auctioneer’s discretion

The auctioneer may vary the increments during the course of the auction at his or her own discretion.

INCREMENTS
BIDDING

≥100
≥2,000
≥3,000
≥5,000
≥10,000
≥20,000
≥30,000
≥50,000
≥100,000
≥200,000

US$30,000 to US$50,000
US$20,000 to US$30,000
US$10,000 to US$20,000
US$5,000 to US$10,000
US$100 to US$2,000
US$2,000 to US$3,000

Above US$200,000
at auctioneer’s discretion

The auctioneer may vary the increments during the course of the auction at his or her own discretion.

1. I request Christie’s to bid on the stated lots up to the maximum bid I have indicated for each lot.

2. I understand that if my bid is successful the amount payable will be the sum of the hammer price and the buyer’s premium (together with any applicable state or local sales or use taxes chargeable on the hammer price and buyer’s premium) in accordance with the Conditions of Sale—Buyer’s Agreement). The buyer’s premium rate shall be an amount equal to 25% of the hammer price of each lot up to and including US$250,000, 20% on any amount over US$250,000 up to and including US$1,000,000 and 15% of the amount above US$1,000,000.

3. I agree to be bound by the Conditions of Sale printed in the catalogue.

4. I understand that if Christie’s receive written bids on a lot for identical amounts and at the auction these are the highest bids on the lot, Christie’s will sell the lot to the bidder whose written bid it received and accepted first.

5. Written bids submitted on “no reserve” lots will, in the absence of a higher bid, be executed at approximately 50% of the low estimate or at the amount of the bid if it is less than 50% of the low estimate.

I understand that Christie’s written bid service is a free service provided for clients and that, while Christie’s will be as careful as it reasonably can be, Christie’s will not be liable for any problems with this service or loss or damage arising from circumstances beyond Christie’s reasonable control.

AUCTION RESULTS: CHRISTIES.COM

Written bids must be received at least 24 hours before the auction begins. Christie’s will confirm all bids received by fax by return fax. If you have not received confirmation within one business day, please contact the Bid Department. Tel: +1 212 636 2437 on-line www.christies.com

Please quote number below:

If you are registered within the European Community for VAT/IVA/TVA/BTW/MWST/MOMS Please quote number below:
ADAM SMITH (1723-1790)
An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations
London: W. Strahan and T. Cadell, 1776.
First edition, the author’s own copy.
£500,000 – 800,000

VALUABLE BOOKS AND MANUSCRIPTS
London, 12 December 2018

VIEWING
1-11 December 2018
8 King Street
London SW1Y 6QT

CONTACT
Eugenio Donadoni
donadoni@christies.com
+44 (0)20 7389 2152

CHRISTIE’S